© Nabhan, Gary Paul, Apr 07, 2014, Cumin, Camels, and Caravans: A Spice Odyssey University of California Press, Berkeley, ISBN: 9780520956957

Vasco da Gama Mastering the Game of Globalization

It is a long way from Zayton, the Chinese port town that was once associated with olive branches, to Lisbon, the Portuguese metropolis where olives, known as *azeitonas*, still grow along the boulevards. And there was just as much psychological distance between their favorite sons, Zheng He and Vasco da Gama. It is difficult to imagine two "explorers" and fleet commanders more dissimilar in their personal and diplomatic styles.

Vasco da Gama missed encountering Zheng He off the coast of East Africa by only about seventy years. The Portuguese spice and slave traders had begun to work their way down the coast of West Africa in the 1440s, less than a decade after Zheng He's death, but da Gama himself did not reach the harbors of East Africa frequented by Muslim spice traders until 1498.¹ As historical geographer Louise Levathes has asked aloud, "One wonders what would have happened if they had met. Realizing the extraordinary power of the Ming navy, would da Gama in his eighty-five to hundred-foot vessels have dared continue across the Indian Ocean? Seeing the battered Portuguese boats, would the Chinese admiral have been tempted to crush these snails in his path, preventing the Europeans from opening an east-west trade route?"²

Perhaps the combined Chinese, Buddhist, and Muslim presence would have nipped Portuguese colonialism in the bud, or at least tempered the zealotry of young Vasco da Gama, who believed himself to be on a holy crusade against Islam's economic and spiritual dominance

along the spice routes.³ We will never know exactly why Manuel I, also known as Manuel the Fortunate, chose young da Gama to lead a major expedition around the Horn of Africa in 1497, since he had little experience on the open seas and no diplomatic training, and was already known for his hot temper and quarrelsome behavior. He was an anomaly, not really representative of seasoned Portuguese sailors, or even of Western navigators of his era. As Fernández-Armesto once quipped, "Once he got to sea, he made almost every possible error." As a teen, he may have fought alongside other youths from the town of Évora in a brief skirmish in Morocco. This may have impressed the young Manuel, a politically incompetent but fanatically religious Catholic who, on marrying the daughter of Ferdinand and Isabella of Spain, decreed that any Sephardic Jews who did not convert to Christianity and all Andalusian Muslims would be expelled from Portugal.⁵

The prices for spices reaching western Europe had soared during the fifteenth century, and the Portuguese were desperate to circumvent the middlemen that stood between them and India—wherever exactly that was—because they had been receiving adulterated saffron and black pepper for more than a half century. The king may have also wanted to expedite dominance over the Spice Islands to halt a growing antispice lobby among Portuguese moralists and economic conservatives. These groups disapproved of the hedonistic desire among Europe's elite for expensive aromatics, claiming that such demands were draining the treasuries of Christian nations while allowing the Muslims to prosper.⁶

Outfitted with four well-equipped ships and instructed to head southward around Africa, da Gama promptly appointed his more level-headed brother Paulo as his right-hand man and then set out from Lisbon. They were charged by the king not with conquering new lands but with contacting Christian nations in the East who might become Portugal's allies in wresting control of the spice routes away from the Muslims. Perhaps because the king was envious of his in-law's apparent success in helping Christopher Columbus discover "some place" beyond the world charted by European mapmakers, the stakes had been raised. It was critical for the Catholic world to ensure it had control of what were actually the Spice Islands, as it was believed that trade from there had fueled Islam's growing wealth and power.

And yet, even with some of Portugal's best navigators aboard, including a number who had sailed south with Bartholomeu Dias to the Cape of Good Hope at the tip of Africa in 1488, da Gama almost did not make it to the reaches of the cape. His tiny ships had been badly bat-

tered during the four months in which they bore the brunt of the powerful waves moving across the southern Atlantic. Even before the crews had actually passed the cape, they made a stop on the coast of southern Africa and terrified a band of residents. Within three days, the coastal community became so incensed with the behavior of the Portuguese that some of its members wounded da Gama and several of his men with arrows.

After several other trials and miscommunications with coastal Africans, da Gama and his seasick crew finally passed the Cape of Good Hope and entered the waters of the Swahili Coast, which was lined with ports unknown to earlier Portuguese navigators. By Christmas Day 1497, da Gama's scurvy-infested crew was finally approaching the trade routes long controlled by Arab seafarers and merchants. And yet it took them two more months of slowly sailing the waters between the southern tip of Africa and Madagascar before they were finally presented with foodstuffs laced with spices that they recognized: "a jar of bruised dates made into a preserve with cloves and cumin."7 Perhaps, they hoped, the Spice Islands were close at hand.

Along the way, da Gama donned the garb of an Arab to win an audience with a local sultan and his family, but then failed to offer his hosts tribute gifts fit for royalty. His inability to fathom the importance of presenting such dignitaries with valuable items as tribute—a custom of the greatest importance throughout Africa and Asia—soon became the unifying theme of the expedition.

Before departing the southern reaches of the Swahili Coast in March 1498, the three Portuguese ships did add Arabic-speaking black guides to their crews at Mozambique. But da Gama soon became so convinced that they were serving as spies for the "White Moors," or Arabs, that he began torturing two of them by dripping hot oil onto their bare skin to get them to confess.8 His tactics were disastrous, for both men squirmed loose and jumped overboard to their deaths.

Left without local speakers to serve as their pilots and intermediaries, the Portuguese fell short on supplies before they could reach Mombasa, and they took to looting Arab cargo ships. Muslim merchants in their seaworthy dhows had already come to view da Gama and his crew as little more than pitiful pirates, so once they did enter the port of Mombasa, they were immediately forced out. They drifted northward toward Malindi, where the local merchants were in competition with those of Mombasa. That rivalry ensured that da Gama received a better reception, and he ceremoniously signed a treaty of cooperation

ф

Ч

屮

占

Cumin (Cuminum cyminum) has merited inclusion in the title of this book exactly because it is so demonstrative of culinary globalization: it has been cultivated, utilized, and traded for so long that no botanist or archaeologist is sure where it originated. Although the broad-brushstroke answer to its place of origin is western Asia, various historians have suggested Palestine, Syria, Lebanon, Turkey, Greece, Ethiopia, and even Southwest Asia as the locus of its domestication. There may be scant agreement as to when, where, or by whom it was domesticated, but there is little doubt as to why it began to be harvested, then managed, and finally cultivated. When toasted and ground, its khaki-colored seeds are so strongly aromatic that few can resist their lure. The cuminaldehydes in its oil have a warm, earthy aroma with a lingering pungency and a flavor that is pleasingly bitter at first, before melting into an aftertaste of sweetness. Cumin flavors are fitting complements to the flavors of many legumes, from garbanzo beans and lentils in the Old World to lima, pinto, and tepary beans in the New World.

Many scholars have established that cumin was harvested and used in the Levant during the earliest Biblical times. Written records describing its inclusion in gardens and fields indicate that it was already well entrenched in the Tigris-Euphrates region when the Mesopotamian and Egyptian civilizations emerged. It appears that Arab spice traders first took it to India, Phoenicians carried it westward through their North African colonies to the Iberian Peninsula, and Berbers transported it across trans-Saharan trade routes into the semiarid Sahel.

The origin of the English term *cumin* lies in the Semitic languages, including the Amharic *kemun*, Akkadian *kamûmu*, Aramaic *kamuna*, Arabic *al-kamoun*, Old Hebrew *kammon*, and Egyptian *kamnini*. The Old Greek *kyminon* and Latin *cuminim* are clearly derived from the Semitic cognate and not the other way around. Most Romance languages retain some variant of these ancient terms, including *cumino*, *comino*, *cominho*, and *cumin*. In Chinese, cumin is *kuming* except

with the sultan of Malindi. The sultan then offered da Gama a supper of six lambs, which were likely richly cooked in the same spices that were given to the Portuguese as special gifts: allspice or nutmeg, cloves, cumin, ginger, and pepper. Again, the ease of access to some of the world's most expensive spices must have made some of the crew assume that their destination was near.

But it was already April 1498 and da Gama knew that he had gained no real knowledge of how to get to the Spice Islands or how far away 口

when speaking of herbal medicine. Then cumin becomes *xiao hui xiang*, which likens it to fennel, just as in some other languages it is confused with caraway. In and near the Indian subcontinent, it appears that most names are rooted in the Sanskrit *jri*, which means to "digest," or "ferment." Indeed, cumin seeds are used as a digestive in many parts of the world.

屮

Once it has been introduced into a new land and culture, cumin has a way of insinuating itself deeply into the local cuisine, which is why is has become one of the most commonly used spices in the world. When an Israeli student whom I was hosting told me that cumin was the signature spice of *hummus bi-tahini* in Tel Aviv, I was taken aback at first, since at that time I believed it was primarily a Mexican spice! Ask chefs in southern India to imagine garam masala without toasted cumin, and they might tell you that *jira* has been in their spice kit since Indians began to cook! Its use in China is championed among the Turkic-speaking Uighur of Xinxiang Province, who likely first received it from Sogdians, Persians, and Arabs traveling the Silk Roads. Cumin is essential to complex savory spice mixtures such as the Berber ras el hanout, Georgian svanuri marili, Yemeni zhoug, and Arab baharat. It is also a key ingredient in Cajun spice mixes, seven seas curry in Malaysia, and Indian masalas. It has made the fewest inroads in Europe, where it is largely limited to flavoring cheese, such as Gouda and Leyden. In fact, in Finnish, juusto means "cheese," and cumin is called juustokumina.

Gambrelle, Fabienne. *The Flavor of Spices*. Paris: Flammarion, 2008. Green, Aliza. *Field Guide to Herbs and Spices*. Philadelphia: Quirk Books, 2006.

Katzer, Gernot. "Gernot Katzer's Spice Pages." http://gernot-katzers-spice-pages.com/engl/index.html. Accessed September 3, 2011.
Sortun, Ana, with Nicole Chaison. Spice: Flavors of the Eastern Mediterranean. New York: Regan Books, 2006.
Weiss, E.A. Spice Crops. Wallingford, UK: CABI Publishing, 2002.

they were. So, he took one of the sultan's diplomats as a hostage and told the sultan that he would exchange him for an expert navigator. Presumably, the sultan agreed to the deal or conceded that he had no choice but to be blackmailed. According to a consensus at a 2012 forum of Gujarati historians and journalists, the talented pilot was most likely a Gujarati originally from the Indian district of Kutch, but whether he was a Muslim or a possible convert from Islam to Christianity is still debated. His name, according to the same scholarly group, was Kanji

Malam, and he was a seafaring trader of indigo and cotton¹¹ who may have been trained by the Arab nautical genius, Ahmad ibn Majid of Julfar (today's Ras al-Khaimah), on the Omani coast.¹² Kanji Malam had probably crossed the Indian Ocean before, carried maps, and knew how to time a ship's departure to take advantage of monsoonal winds.

Thanks to the guidance of this experienced navigator, Vasco da Gama arrived a few miles from the port of Calicut, India, in May 1498, and quickly claimed to have discovered India for the West. As we now know, an itinerant Portuguese named Pêro da Covilhã had come by land to the very same harbor almost a decade earlier.¹³ To da Gama's dismay, his second day in port was spoiled by the arrival on his ship of two Spanishspeaking Tunisians! They were Muslims from the Barbary Coast who had arrived in Calicut via Cairo and the Red Sea, and they regularly traded with the local merchants.14 The Tunisians passed word of da Gama's arrival to the overseer of India's great spice emporium, and soon da Gama was welcomed by the hereditary ruler of the Malabar Coast, the samudra-raja or samuthiri, whom the Portuguese called the zamorin. At that time, the samuthiri was a rather timid Hindu puppet lord for Muslim merchants who truly ruled the harbor of Calicut, but later rulers became the worst rivals the Portuguese warlords encountered along the Indian Ocean.

The Portuguese could immediately see that Calicut, which had been the cornerstone of both maritime spice trade around southern Asia and overland trade from the hinterlands for well over two hundred years, was endowed with enormous wealth. As the Portuguese Renaissance historian Fernão Lopes de Castanheda later chronicled, the bazaar was loaded with "all the spices, drugs, nutmegs, and other things that can be desired, all kinds of precious stones, pearls and seed-pearls, musk, sanders [sandalwood], aguila [eagles], fine dishes of earthen ware, lacquer, gilded coffers, and all the fine things of China, gold, amber, wax, ivory, fine and coarse cotton goods, both white and dyed of many colors, much raw and twisted silk, stuffs of silk and gold, cloth of gold, cloth of tissue, grain, scarlets [dyes], silk carpets, copper, quicksilver, vermilion, alum, coral, rose-water, and all kinds of [fruit] conserves." This was in fact the mother lode of pepper, the Malabar Coast that the Christians of western Europe had been waiting to mine for a very long time.

When da Gama offered the *samuthiri* a few petty gifts in exchange for building a trading post there with exclusive rights to send spices westward, the Muslim merchants who had previously enjoyed a similar agreement with the Hindu ruler took offense. Da Gama's tribute to



FIGURE 19. Vasco da Gama shown delivering the letter of King Manuel of Portugal to the samuthiri of Calicut. (Courtesy Library of Congress Prints and Photographs Division, www.loc.gov/pictures/item/92513908.)

the ruler of the greatest spice emporium on the subcontinent—the one whom he had waited so long to see-amounted to only one case of cane sugar, two barrels of olive oil, two casks of honey, twelve pieces of striped cloth, four scarlet hoods, six hats, four strings of coral, and six brass basins. The samuthiri himself soon saw da Gama's impropriety, when the Portuguese commander claimed he had brought so few goods along because he had been instructed by his king only to make discoveries.16

The samuthiri and his advisers denied him exclusive rights and demanded that the Portuguese pay custom fees for trading in his kingdom. He then kidnapped da Gama and three other men and sent a notice to his brother Paulo that they would not be released until a ransom was paid. Paulo loaded up a dory with all of the most valuable goods from Europe still on the ships—other than statues of the Virgin and crosses—and paid the ransom. Frustrated and annoyed, Vasco da Gama instructed some of his men to remain in Calicut as the main conduits to their hosts on the Malabar Coast in case the samuthiri became more open to trade negotiations over the following weeks. Da Gama then took off with what he hoped were just enough exotic goods to be able to justify his long and expensive trip to King Manuel. Just before departing from Calicut, he kidnapped a few locals just to show his belligerence. When he reached Portugal, he displayed enough black pepper and hyperbole to be declared a hero.

Portugal's Fourth Armada to India in 1502 was prompted by a report that in the intervening years, a few of the trusted colleagues that da Gama had left in Calicut had been massacred by Muslim traders. The command post of the new armada was originally offered to Pedro Álvarez Cabral, the Portuguese discoverer of Brazil and leader of the second and third armadas to India. But just a few days before the armada departed, Cabral was replaced by da Gama, whom Manuel I titled Admiral of the Seas of Arabia, Persia, India, and all the Orient. He first put in at Cochin to gain support for his cause and then arrived in Calicut with sixteen heavily armed ships. He demanded that the samuthiri expel all Arab Muslim traders from the city and hoped that the same might be done in other ports along the Malabar Coast. When his request was denied, he bombarded the city until the ruler surrendered. Later, Portugal was given exclusive trading rights to all spices coming into ports of the Malabar Coast. For da Gama, this was the crowning moment of his personal crusade: to break the back of Islam by usurping its role in the spice trade. It also set the stage for the more disturbing elements of the next five centuries of globalization, in which economic, spiritual, and military imperialism went hand in hand.

After his arrival in Calicut, da Gama exacted revenge for the earlier deaths of his colleagues by capturing an unarmed Arab ship, the $M\bar{\imath}r\bar{\imath}$, which was traveling between Calicut and Cochin. It was filled with nearly three hundred Muslims, including at least ten of the wealthiest spice traders from Calicut, all of whom were returning from the hajj. The group's leader, Jauhar al-Faqih, was not only a prominent spice merchant but also the diplomatic counsel to Calicut for the sultan of Mecca. He tried to negotiate with da Gama, offering him a wealth of spices and other treasures, if the Portuguese would spare his family and friends. But da Gama ordered his men to rob them of all of their gold, kidnap all of the children, and then set the ship on fire. After a five-day struggle, da Gama watched as nearly 250 passengers—the ones who had not already jumped overboard—were killed.

On witnessing this incident, a Portuguese companion of da Gama's, Gaspar Correia, called it an act of unequaled cruelty in the history of his people.¹⁷ Centuries later, an Indian historian of the incident, Sanjay Subrahmanyam, suggested that it was a turning point in the history of maritime trade, for it introduced the systematic use of violence at sea.

Subrahmanyam controversially claims that such methodical genocide was first executed at the hands of Portuguese Christians on an unsanctioned crusade to devastate the Islamic world. 18

Given the title of viceroy by John III, Manuel I's son and successor, da Gama set out on his third voyage to India in 1424. Within a few months of his arrival, he died in Cochin, after having squirmed for days with inexplicable pain. It is said that he suffered to the end from hard boils festering at the base of his neck, ones that propelled him into "great fits of irritation, [and] with the heavy burdens that he felt on account of the many things which he had done and had yet to do, [the pain] of his illness was doubled."19

Da Gama continued to travel without much rest for centuries. He was first buried in silk garments in a humble Franciscan church in Cochin, where Gaspar Correia reported that a couple of Portuguese mercenaries grieved for having lost "so honored a father, and [for having to lay him to rest] in such a desert of a place, of all the places in the entire kingdom of Portugal."20 In 1538, his bones were repatriated to a convent in Vidigueira, Portugal, where the title of count had been bestowed on him in 1419. In 1880, they were supposedly disinterred and reburied at the Jerónimos Monastery in the Belém harbor, on the edge of Lisbon. But it was discovered some years later that the wrong set of bones had been transported. Not long after that accident was revealed, officials had what they hoped were da Gama's true bones moved to the monastery and then held a discreet celebration to commemorate the transition.²¹

Today, the tomb of Vasco da Gama sits alongside those of kings in the monastery on the Lisbon waterfront. The explorer rests within spitting distance of the tomb of his benefactor, Manuel I.

During my only week-long visit to Lisbon, the first thing I did after putting my bags down in my hotel room was begin the slow walk down from the coastal hills to the shores of the Tagus River where it widens into a bay. There, in the parish of Belém, the Jerónimos Monastery sits a few hundred yards from the waterfront.

As I walked into the monastery's cathedral and read on a multilingual sign that Manuel I had built the complex to celebrate Portugal's role in what we now call the Age of Discovery, my head began to reel. Da Gama's tomb, which stands just inside the entrance, was surrounded by a spiral of tourists waiting to get close to it. When I finally stood before the gilded tomb, I tried once more to read about the man who is known as the first count of Vidigueira, an admiral and viceroy of India, and an

esteemed member of the Order of Christ. As the crowd pressed in behind me, I began to feel claustrophobic, and I quickly turned and left the cathedral without seeing the tombs of the other famous men interred there.

Each day I was in Lisbon, I would walk the streets seeking neighborhood spice markets, but had little luck finding anything of significance. But the fourth day, while walking along the waterfront, I met a resident of Lisbon whom I asked to direct me to a typical outdoor market-place where I might see some fresh produce and spices. He looked at me quizzically and rather than recommending that I visit the Mercado da Ribeira, a 125-year-old indoor fish, cheese, produce, herb, flower and meat market of considerable proportions but of little historic significance, he directed me to the oldest extant marketplace in Lisbon, back up in the hills overlooking the Tagus.

I climbed and climbed, spiraling up narrow roads until I came to the address the man had given me. There I saw what *feira*, or "market," has come to mean for most Portuguese. It was what Americans might call a flea market or a swap meet for the poor. Although a few drinks and some fresh watermelons were sold by a couple of vendors, the rest of the merchandise was made up of piles of cast-offs from the last half century of Western civilization. No aromatic herbs, not even a cheap aphrodisiac. Why look for such a thing when there are pornographic video-cassettes and piles of CDs? There were cell phones and electric mixers, transistor radios and boom boxes. There were stalls full of fake leather accessories—belts, collars, and bracelets—and heaps of used auto parts, battered motorcycles, and scooters.

So, other than some *piri piri* hot sauce, cumin, and coriander, this is what globalized trade has ultimately provided to the Portuguese? These are the treasures that da Gama bestowed on his people by freeing the trade routes from the hands of the evil Muslims.

Fortunately, da Gama was followed by a man who was less brutal and more of a naval strategist. Afonso de Albuquerque first arrived in the Indian Ocean in 1503. It was about the same time that the last Banu Nebhani, a poetry-writing ancestor of mine named Sulayman ibn Sulayman al-Nebhani, was ruling Oman. He heard through the grapevine that Omani dissidents dissatisfied with his reign had begun clandestine negotiations with the Portuguese to overthrow him, and within a year's time of the rumors, the 350-year control of Oman's spice-trading ports by my Banu Nebhani tribe had collapsed.²² It was an earlier season of Arab Spring.

By 1507, de Albuquerque had closed off the Gulf of Hormuz so

that Persian and Arab ships could not easily reach India. He soon closed off all of the spice trade by other nations between the Atlantic, Mediterranean, and Red Sea on one side, and the Persian Gulf, Indian Ocean, and Pacific Ocean on the other. With less blood spilled than what da Gama had exacted, he had taken control of the ports of Muscat and Sohar from the resident Omani Muslims and Jews, and without incident had pressured Dhofar into surrender and into signing a treaty. In less than a decade, he turned the Indian Ocean into a mare clausum in which the Portuguese exclusively controlled the trade that the Turks, the Radhanites, and the Karimi had previously managed.

He stormed into Malacca—the central port for the Spice Islands and the westernmost reach of Chinese sailors—shot a few elephants, and sent the Muslim sultan running for his life. He dispatched ambassadors to Siam and to Canton, the far reaches of the known world.²³ The bridge between the Muslims of the Far East and of the Middle East had been closed on the overland routes of the Silk Roads by the Ottoman Empire around 1380, but it took more than another century for the bridge across the seas to come tumbling down. The pivotal role in the transcontinental trade of aromatics that my own tribe had been engaged in for centuries had apparently come to a close.

As I have learned recently, however, some of the Banu Nebhani tribe had moved on from Oman not long before the fall of their dynasty there. In the fourteenth century, an heir to the Nebhani mercantile fortune in Muscat and Bahla absconded with some of his inheritance and established his own nation-state in the Lamu Archipelago off the coast of Kenya. His name was Sultan Ahmad Abu Bakar Nebhani and he called his new kingdom and spice trading colony Akhbar Pate (or Patta).²⁴

Native Kenyans as well as archaeologists who have visited Pate Island tell me that the prehistoric ruins from the era of Akhbar Pate continue to be impressive. On the eastern edge of the island are the remains of Shanga, a city built on white coral that was abandoned in the fourteenth century. Today, the site is littered with pottery shards and half-broken statuary that archaeologist James de Vere Allen believes came from Asia.²⁵ At its center are the ruins of a large mosque and a strange stone tomb with fluted pillars decorated with green celadon bowls. Similar fluted-pillar tombs are found not only on Pate but also up and down the Kenyan and Somali coasts wherever ancient harbors of the spice trade once stood. One such tomb can be found amid the ruins of the centuries-old town of Gedi, between Malindi and Mombasa, the two greatest spice-trading towns of the East African coast.

© Nabhan, Gary Paul, Apr 07, 2014, Cumin, Camels, and Caravans: A Spice Odyssey University of California Press, Berkeley, ISBN: 9780520956957

But what is even more curious than the archaeological sites on Pate are the appearance and customs of its current inhabitants. Community members of a fishing culture on Pate called the Bajuni were described by anthropologist Nello Puccioni in 1935 as having "a physical type absolutely different from other people of the region. The skin is rather light, in some, slightly olive. And in the men you can spot flowing beards; and the women part their hair in the middle and weave it into two side braids." ²⁶

Although no published genetic studies exist that confirm the probable multiple origins of the Bajuni people, linguists suggest that remnants of their dialect can be found in coastal Somalia and Kenya, and that they include loan words or grammatical structures from Somali, Arab, Indian, Persian, and possibly Southeast Asian languages.

Customs and language point strongly toward multiple origins of the Bajunis of Shanga, though scholarly work in the past conjectured that they came directly from Shanghai and remain a relatively pure example of an early Chinese diaspora.²⁷ Genetic evidence to date cannot confirm that. My own favored hypothesis, for a hybrid origin of coastal African peoples, with Arab, Persian, Indian, and Chinese traders, is at least as viable. It speaks to the fact that spice trade over millennia drove not only the structure, ethics (or lack of them), and culture of globalization but also brought various genetic populations back together again into a "rainbow" human family. The Lamu Archipelago on which my ancestors lived six centuries ago may have been inhabited by as many genetically mixed individuals from various continents as a place like Hawaii is today. Perhaps the ongoing underwater archaeological excavations in the Lamu Archipelago of a Chinese ship sunk roughly six centuries ago-when my Banu Nebhani kin were still on Pate-will eventually tell us something of that lost hybrid world, another island of convivencia where multicultural exchanges were perhaps virtuous for a while.

- 19. Lilian Swee Lian Chua, "Agarwood (*Aquilaria malaccensis*) in Malaysia," NDF Workshop Case Studies (Mexico D.F.: CONABIO, 2008).
 - 20. Dreyer, *Zheng He*, 64–65.
- 21. Yusuf Chang quoted in "The History of Ming" (Beijing: China Scientific Book Services, n.d), www.hceis.com/ChinaBasic/History/Ming/htm. Stanley Hordes, *To the Ends of the Earth: A History of the Crypto-Jews of New Mexico* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005).
- 22. Janet Liebman Jacobs, "Women, Ritual and Secrecy: The Creation of Crypto-Jewish Culture," Society for Crypto-Jewish Culture (2000), www.cryptojews.com/WomenRitual.htm.
 - 23. Levathes, When China Ruled the Seas, 198-200.
- 24. Chen Da-sheng, "Chinese-Iranian Relations. VII. Persian Settlements in Southeastern China during the T'ang, Sung, and Yuan Dynasties," *Encyclopaedia Iranica*, www.iranicaonline.org/articles/chinese-iranian-vii; accessed July 9, 2013.

II. VASCO DA GAMA MASTERING THE GAME OF GLOBALIZATION

- 1. Jack Turner, *Spice: The History of a Temptation* (New York: Vintage, 2005), 14–15.
- 2. Louise Levathes, When China Ruled the Seas: The Treasure Fleet of the Dragon Throne 1405–1433 (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994), 148–49.
- 3. Ronald Watkins, *Unknown Seas: How Vasco da Gama Opened the East* (London: John Murray, 2003).
- 4. Felipe Fernández-Armesto, *Near a Thousand Tables: A History of Food* (New York: Free Press, 2002), 158.
 - 5. Levathes, When China Ruled the Seas, 21.
- 6. Nigel Cliff, Holy War: How Vasco da Gama's Epic Voyages Turned the Tide in a Centuries-Old Clash of Civilizations (New York: HarperCollins, 2011).
- 7. E.G. Ravenstein, ed., A Journal of the First Voyage of Vasco da Gama, 1497–1499 (London: Hakluyt Society, 1898), 28.
- 8. K.G. Jayne, Vasco da Gama and His Successors 1460–1580 (New York: Barnes and Noble, 1910).
 - 9. Cliff, Holy War.
- 10. Sanjay Subrahmanyam, The Career and Legend of Vasco da Gama (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997).
- 11. Vinod K. Jose, "The Emperor Uncrowned: The Rise of Narendra Modi," *The Caravan*, March 1, 2012.
 - 12. Watkins, Unknown Seas, 229-30.
 - 13. Cliff, Holy War.
- 14. Alison Stark Draper, Vasco da Gama: The Portuguese Quest for a Sea Route to India (New York: Rosen Publishing Group, 2003).
- 15. Fernão Lopes de Castanheda, quoted in 2:346–347 of A General History and Collection of Voyages and Travels, ed. Robert Kerr (Edinburgh, Scotland: William Blackwood, 1811).

© Nabhan, Gary Paul, Apr 07, 2014, Cumin, Camels, and Caravans: A Spice Odyssey University of California Press, Berkeley, ISBN: 9780520956957

- 16. Cliff, Holy War.
- 17. Gaspar Correia, quoted in Lendas da India, ed. R.J. de Lima Felner (Lisbon: Archivos Real, 1858–1864).
 - 18. Sanjay Subrahmanyan, The Career and Legend of Vasco da Gama.
 - 19. Cliff, *Holy War*, 505.
 - 20. Gaspar Correia, quoted in R.J. de Lima, ed., Lendas da India.
 - 21. Cliff, Holy War, 505.
- 22. Hasan M. al-Naboodah, "The Banu Nabhan in the Omani Sources," in New Arabic Studies, ed. G. Rex Smart, J.R. Smart, and B.R. Pridham (Exeter: University of Exeter Press, 1997), 181–98.
 - 23. Cliff, Holy War.
- 24. Gary Paul Nabhan, Arab-American: Landscape, Culture and Cuisine in Two Great Deserts (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2008), 80–81.
 - 25. Levathes, When China Ruled the Seas, 201.
- 26. Nello Puccioni, "Anthropological Studies of the Bajuni," Giuba o Oltregiuba: Itinerary of the Mission of the Italian Academy, 1935 (Florence: Sansoni-Editore, 1937), 110.
 - 27. Levathes, When China Ruled the Seas, 198–203. See also Menzies, 1421.

12. CROSSING THE DRAWBRIDGE OVER THE EASTERN OCEAN

- 1. J.M. Carrillo Castillo, ed., Gonzalez Fernandez de Oviedo: Oviedo on Columbus (Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols, 2000).
 - 2. Ibid.
- 3. Gordon Willard Allport, The Nature of Prejudice (New York: Basic Books, 1979).
- 4. Seymour B. Liebman, The Jews in New Spain: Faith, Flame, and the Inquisition (Coral Gables, FL: University of Miami Press, 1970).
- 5. Saulat Pervez, "Latin America: Historical Legacy," www.whyislam.org/ muslim-world/latin-america-historical-overview; accessed July 9, 2013 (bracketed interpolations mine). See also Habeeb Salloum, "Arabs in Latin America: Cuba's Disappearing Arab Community," *Alminbar* 14 (1987): 14.
- 6. Luis Alberto Anaya Hernández, Judeoconversos e Inquisición en las Islas Canarias (Las Palmas de Gran Canaria: Universidad de Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, 1996).
- 7. Pamela Grau Twena, The Sephardic Table (New York: Houghton-Mifflin, 1998), 17.
- 8. Norman Finkelstein, The Other 1492: Jewish Settlement in the New World (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1989).
- 9. Clifford A. Wright, "The Medieval Spice Trade and the Diffusion of Chile," *Gastronomica* 7 (2007): 35-43.
- 10. Frances Levine, "'So Dreadful a Crime': Doña Teresa Aguilera y Roche Faces the Inquisition for the Sin of Chocolate Consumption," El Palacio 117 (Winter): 52-59.
- 11. Rafael López Guzmán, Mudéjar Hispano y Americano: Itinerarios Culturales Mexicanos (Granada, Spain: Fundación El Legado Andalusí, 2002).
 - 12. My translation from Spanish of material from Lourdes Diaz-Trechuelo

© Nabhan, Gary Paul, Apr 07, 2014, Cumin, Camels, and Caravans: A Spice Odyssey University of California Press, Berkeley, ISBN: 9780520956957